MINUTES OF MEETING OF THE BRENTWOOD PLANNING COMMISSION

BRENTWOOD, TENNESSEE

The regular meeting of the Brentwood Planning Commission met on Monday, March 4, 2019 at 7:00 p.m. at Brentwood City Hall.

Present at roll call were Chairman Janet Donahue, Commissioner Ken Travis, John Church, Chris Clark, Carole Crigger, John Magyar, Brandon Oliver, Stevan Pippin, Sonna Robinson and Sandi Wells. Staff present were Jeff Dobson, Kirk Bednar, Jay Evans, Kristen Corn, Mike Harris, Steve Foster, Katie Jardieu, and Darek Baskin.

Mr. Pippin moved for approval of the minutes from the February 4, 2019 meeting as written; seconded by Mr. Magyar. Motion passed 9-0 with Mr. Oliver abstaining.

**CONSENT AGENDA**

Item 1: **BPC1902-001 Limited Duration Event – Nashville Golf Open, Nashville Golf Athletic Club, 1703 Crockett Springs Trail, Zoning OSRD/R-1**

NGO Snedeker Foundation, LLC requested approval of the third in a series of the Nashville Golf Open to be played at the Nashville Golf and Athletic Club (NGAC). This event is scheduled from April 29th through May 5, 2019. Tour Vision Promotions previously negotiated a five-year agreement with the Club, running through 2020.

The event operates under a 501c3 non-profit organization, with the Snedeker Foundation acting as the title sponsor for the event.

Net proceeds from the tournament will benefit The First Tee of Middle Tennessee, a regional youth life skills program operated by the Tennessee Golf Foundation, a charitable organization. It will also benefit the Snedeker Foundation.

A professional practice day is scheduled on April 29th and the Pro-Am on May 1st. The tournament begins on May 2nd and continues through May 5th. On all days’ transportation to the events from the off-site parking lots begins at around 6:00 a.m.

An off-site parking area will be provided via an agreement with WCS at Ravenwood HS, which includes 1,251 spaces. Note that the last day for students in for the SY 2019 is May 23rd. The parking provided at RHS on May 4 & 5 will be on a Saturday and Sunday.

Each resident living on Andrew Crockett Court will receive a packet offering a schedule of activities and times, passes to the event, and a car lanyard for their vehicles to make sure they are afforded quick and easy access to their homes.

A number of temporary structures including tents, equipment and vender trucks, will be set up around the course to support the event. Most of the temporary structures will be located in the area around the existing clubhouse.

Staff recommended approval of the Limited Duration Event, subject to the following conditions:

1. The applicant shall coordinate with the Police and Public Works Departments regarding the erection of temporary no parking signs on several residential streets in the area.
2. Appropriate off-site directional signage, on behalf of the City, per Sec. 78-419(e), to be funded by the tournament, may be permitted to assist spectators in locating the off-site parking lots. The wording used on the signs shall be approved in advance by City staff. All signs must comply with the Brentwood Sign Ordinance.
3. A representative from the event shall coordinate with the residents who live within the subdivision.
4. Beer permits must be approved by the City Commission. Application must be received on or before April 1st, for review by the City commissions on April 22nd.
5. The applicant shall submit plans for the event to staff from review and approval by the Planning Commission annually.
6. The event organizers shall coordinate the event with Planning and Codes, Police and Fire Department personnel.
7. Provide a schedule of the setup of the temporary structures. Planning and Codes Department staff must inspect all temporary structures, especially those that will be provided electricity before the event begins. Staff shall also be provided access to the site before and during the event.
8. All ingress and egress points must remain clear and accessible for emergency services at all times during the event.
9. Generators and lights shall be placed so as to lessen their impact on adjacent neighbors.
10. Provide specifications for the generators that are to be used. Include operating noise levels. Indicate if they are gas or diesel fueled. Also include the noise levels for the refrigeration units that may be mounted on vender trailers.
11. Crockett Springs Trail and Andrew Crockett Court are publically maintained streets. There shall be no temporary improvements located with the right-of-way of these streets.
12. If access/use of Rue de Grande, a private street is proposed, permission must be granted in advance by the Crockett Springs, Phase I Homeowners Association.
13. The property owner is responsible for all development fees including water and sewer service and tap fees, building permit fees and Public Works Project Fees.
14. Complete plans shall be submitted to the Planning and Codes Department for review, approval and issuance of the required permits before any work is begun. Additionally, all required electrical permits, issued by the State of Tennessee must be received before any work is begun.
15. Deviations from the approved plan or the failure to satisfy any standard requirements or special conditions of approval imposed by the planning commission will be considered a violation of the provisions of the Zoning Ordinance, which shall be subject to punishment as provided in Section 1-9 of the Brentwood Municipal Code. The City may also require the applicant to appear before the Planning Commission to address any deficiencies or unapproved modifications. The project may also be subject to delays in issuance of permits, certificates of occupancy, recordation of plats or other project approvals.
16. Development of this project shall comply with all applicable codes and ordinances of the City of Brentwood.
17. Approval of the proposed plan shall be limited to the illustrations and plans presented to the Planning Commission for review and approval on March 4, 2019. Any changes to Planning Commission approved plans and specifications will require staff review and re-approval by the Planning Commission.

Item 2: BPC1902-002 Revised Building Elevations – Brentwood Church of Christ, 208 Granny White Pike, Zoning SI-1

Harber Architecture requested approval of revised building elevations to Brentwood Church of Christ, located at 20-8 Granny White Pike. The proposed changes included the following:

1. The addition of smooth metal panels, in a charcoal gray color;
2. The addition of corrugated metal panels, in a slate gray color;
3. Removal of the existing mansard roof;
4. Painting the existing brick a shade of gray, and
5. Adding a stone veneer at base of building.

Staff recommended approval of the proposed Building Elevations subject to the following conditions:

1. Approval of a site plan by the Planning Commission shall vested for a period of three years for the original date of approval.
2. Add the following note to the site plan;

This site plan is subject to a three year vesting period, during which the development standards in effect on the date of approval will remain the standards applicable to this plan.  If construction is not completed during the first three years, the original site plan is considered a preliminary site plan and the applicant must obtain approval of a final site plan. Development of the property shown on this plan may be subject to standards other than those that were applicable during the vesting period.  The Initial vesting period for this plan expires on March 4, 2022, unless extended by the City of Brentwood.  Persons relying on this plan after said date should contact the City of Brentwood to determine if development may continue as depicted on the plan.

1. When the construction authorized pursuant to a site plan is not completed within three years from the date of initial approval, but the applicant desires to complete the project proposed for the site, the plan as initially approved for the project or as amended shall be considered a preliminary site plan. If the applicant secures all necessary permits, commences site preparation and obtains approval of a final site plan within the three-year vesting period following approval of the preliminary site plan, then the vesting period shall be extended an additional two years beyond the expiration of the initial three-year vesting period. During the two-year extension, the applicant must commence construction and maintain any necessary permits to remain vested.
2. If necessary permits are maintained and construction, as defined by Section 78-43, has commenced by the end of the two-year extension, then the vesting period shall remain in effect until the Planning and Codes Department has certified final completion of the project, provided the total vesting period shall not exceed ten years from the date of approval of the preliminary site plan.
3. If the construction authorized pursuant to a site plan is completed within three years from the date of approval, the site plan shall then be considered the final site plan for the project.
4. The property owner is responsible for all development fees including water and sewer service and tap fees, building permit fees and Public Works Project Fees. The required fees shall be used for future infrastructure related improvements required by the proposed development.
5. A Maintenance Agreement and Storm Water System Long-Term Operation and Maintenance Plan for all storm water structures and facilities must be prepared, submitted and approved per Section 56-43 of the Brentwood Code.
6. Approval of the site plan does not constitute approval of the signage plan. All signs must comply with the Brentwood Sign Ordinance. A comprehensive sign package including all signs (temporary or permanent, wall or ground) must be submitted to the Planning Department for review.
7. Deviations from the approved plan in the development of a project or the failure to satisfy any standard requirements or special conditions of approval imposed by the planning commission will be considered a violation of the provisions of the Zoning Ordinance, which shall be subject to punishment as provided in Section 1-9 of the Brentwood Municipal Code. The City may also require the applicant to appear before the Planning Commission to address any deficiencies or unapproved modifications. The project may also be subject to delays in issuance of permits, certificates of occupancy, recordation of plats or other project approvals.
8. Any changes to plans approved by the Planning Commission will require staff review and re-approval by the Planning Commission.
9. Development of this project shall comply with all applicable codes and ordinances of the City of Brentwood.
10. All previous conditions placed on the project by the Planning Commission shall remain applicable to the project.
11. Approval of the proposed plan shall be limited to the illustrations and plans presented to the Planning Commission for review and approval on March 4, 2019. Any changes to Planning Commission approved plans and specifications will require staff review and re-approval by the Planning Commission.

Commissioner Travis moved for approval of the items on the Consent Agenda. Seconded by Mr. Oliver; motion was approved unanimously.

# REGULAR AGENDA

**Item 1:** **ORDINANCE 2019-02 - AN ORDINANCE REZONING PROPERTY LOCATED AT 9551 SPLIT LOG ROAD FROM R-2 (SUBURBAN RESIDENTIAL) TO SI-3 (SERVICE INSTITUTION - CULTURAL, RECREATIONAL AND GOVERNMENTAL)**

Ordinance 2019-02 requested the rezoning of approximately two acres of City-owned property located at 9551 Split Log Road from the R-2 (Suburban Residential) zoning district to the SI-3 -- Service Institution (Cultural, Recreational and Governmental) zoning district.

The City purchased the property on November 20, 2018.

The Fire and Rescue Department's strategic plan has identified a future need for a fifth fire station located in the rapidly growing southeastern portion of the City. The plan provided that the station would be placed along Split Log Road somewhere between the Northumberland Subdivision and the intersection of Split Log and Ragsdale Roads. Over the past several years, City staff worked to identify a suitable location in the area to construct a fifth station. Last fall, the subject property was purchased by the City, with the goal that it will ultimately house a new fire station. While the property is not located directly along the preferred corridor, it is only approximately 375 feet east of the intersection of Split Log and Ragsdale Roads. In addition, the tract is located far enough from existing adjacent residential properties so as to afford some buffering from the activities that traditionally occur at a fire station.

The City's capital improvements plan does not anticipate design work on a new station to begin until FY 2023. That schedule could change somewhat when the City prepares the FY 2020-2025 CIP this spring. The exact timing for construction of the station will be dependent upon the availability of future capital funding.

A development plan, which would include detailed engineering for the site, has not yet been prepared. However, as part of the City's due diligence before purchase, a "concept" plan was drafted in an effort to determine the suitability of the property for its proposed future use. The sketches show the possible building envelope in conformance with zoning requirements and a layout of a building footprint. The area of the proposed two-story building would be approximately 11,000 square feet. The exterior design and materials would be similar to that used on residential structures in the area. The new station would house one response unit and one crew. Additionally, it is expected that one ambulance crew could also be accommodated in the building.

Additional plantings would be provided in the buffer between the building and Split Log Road and the adjacent residential properties. However, prior to having any formal documents prepared, staff is requesting that the property be rezoned.

The ordinance was approved first reading on February 11th. The required community meeting was conducted by staff on February 28th. No citizens attended the meeting. The public hearing is scheduled for March 11th, with second and final reading scheduled for March 25, 2019.

Mr. Church moved to forward a recommendation of approval of Ordinance 2019-02 to the Board of Commissioners. Seconded by Ms. Wells; motion was approved unanimously.

**Item 2:** **BPC1807-007 Revised Master Plan – Brentwood United Methodist Church, 309 Franklin Road, Zoning SI-1**

Ragan Smith Associates requested approval of a revised Master Plan for the Brentwood United Methodist Church site, located at 309 Franklin Road. The master plan included:

1. Removal of one existing driveway from Williamsburg Road to accommodate 11 new parking spaces.
2. Construction of a building addition having an area of 26,399 square feet.
3. Relocation of the existing playground across the parking lot to the west side of the building A second playground will also be constructed on the north side of the building.
4. A total of 184 parking spaces are shown in the NW corner of the site, 94 of these spaces, closest to Williamsburg Road, are designated as “future reserve.” These spaces are shown on the plan to meet the code requirements and will not be constructed until a future need has been determined.
5. The future parking area fronting Meadowlake Road shows a total of 152 future spaces, which is 94 spaces less than shown on the plan in October 2018, and are designated to be held as “future reserve”. These spaces are shown on the plan to meet the code requirements and will not be constructed until a future need has been determined.
6. The surface of the parking areas in the NW corner and on the south side of the site will be constructed using pervious pavers. This would include the 94 designated “future reserve” spaces in the NW area and the 152 spaces in the southerly area.
7. The previously shown driveway access from Williamsburg Road into the NW parking area has been eliminated from the plan.

The property will be screened on all sides adjacent to residential zones with a 50 foot wide vegetative buffer. The required 150 foot wide arterial road buffer along Franklin Road will remain in place. The buffers will meet the planting requirements of Section 78-512 of the Code.

The parking lot design for the NW and southerly parking areas has been revised, reducing the number of spaces in both areas to comply with the requirements of the waterway natural areas.

Please note that this proposal represents a Preliminary Master Plan. Final engineering has not yet been completed for the project. Upon submittal of the detailed site plan for review and approval, complete engineering design will be required. Development of the property will comply with City of Brentwood’s drainage standards, TDEC and Corps of Engineers requirements before a permit will be issued for any portion of the project.

The five-acre tract located at the corner of Meadowlake Road and Franklin Road was rezoned per Ordinance 2002-02 to SI-1/SR in June 2002.

Ordinance 2018-18, which was approved on second and final reading in January allows 50% of the required parking spaces to be built on-site, 30% reserved off-site and 20% reserved on-site for future construction. The revisions to the Code allowed the church to reduce their number of on-site parking spaces by 119 spaces, or from 738 as shown on the plan dated October 2018 to 619 spaces as shown on the current plan.

Citizen Comments:

Sarah Reeves, 307 Robinhood Road

Taj Wolff, 5100 Williamsburg Road

Lee Luton, 5016 Williamsburg Road

Steve Burgin, 8228 Victory Trail

Linda Jones Ellis, 5009 Meadow Lake Road

Betsy Davies, 5010 Country Club Court

Leslie Hotzfeld, 1711 Charity Drive

Anita Hogin, 311 Robinhood Road

Michael Hurst, 312 Oakvale Drive

Lori Walters, 5309 Williamsburg Road

Mr. Oliver moved for approval of the proposed Preliminary Master Plan subject to the following conditions being met to the satisfaction of staff:

1. Label the Stream Buffer on the plan and designate it as a PUDE. The buffer must comply with the Waterway Natural Area requirements as detailed in Section 56-31 of the Municipal Code.
2. Development of the project shall comply with the City of Brentwood stormwater/drainage standards, and State and Federal requirements before a permit will be issued for any portion of the project.
3. As part of the submittal of the detailed site plan, the Church shall provide security acceptable to the City in an amount equivalent to the cost of constructing the parking area left undeveloped in compliance with Section 78-455(5) of the Municipal Code.
4. All buffer landscaping must meet the requirements of Sections 78-264, 78-266 and 78-512 of the Municipal Code.
5. A Preliminary Master Plan shall be vested for a period of three years from the date of the original approval.
6. Add the following note to the site plan;

This preliminary master plan is subject to a three year vesting period, during which the development standards in effect on the date of approval will remain the standards applicable to this plan.  If construction is not completed during the first three years, the original site plan is considered a preliminary site plan and the applicant must obtain approval of a final site plan. Development of the property shown on this plan may be subject to standards other than those that were applicable during the vesting period.  The Initial vesting period for this plan expires on March 4, 2022, unless extended by the City of Brentwood.  Persons relying on this plan after said date should contact the City of Brentwood to determine if development may continue as depicted on the plan.

1. When the construction authorized pursuant to a site plan is not completed within three years from the date of initial approval, but the applicant desires to complete the project proposed for the site, the plan as initially approved for the project or as amended shall be considered a preliminary site plan. If the applicant secures all necessary permits, commences site preparation and obtains approval of a final site plan within the three-year vesting period following approval of the preliminary site plan, then the vesting period shall be extended an additional two years beyond the expiration of the initial three-year vesting period. During the two-year extension, the applicant must commence construction and maintain any necessary permits to remain vested.
2. If necessary permits are maintained and construction, as defined by Section 78-43, has commenced by the end of the two-year extension, then the vesting period shall remain in effect until the Planning and Codes Department has certified final completion of the project, provided the total vesting period shall not exceed ten years from the date of approval of the preliminary site plan.
3. If the construction authorized pursuant to a site plan is completed within three years from the date of approval, the site plan shall then be considered the final site plan for the project.
4. The property owner is responsible for all development fees including water and sewer service and tap fees, building permit fees and Public Works Project Fees. The required fees shall be used for future infrastructure related improvements required by the proposed development.
5. A Maintenance Agreement and Storm Water System Long-Term Operation and Maintenance Plan for all storm water structures and facilities must be prepared, submitted and approved per Section 56-43 of the Brentwood Code.
6. Approval of the site plan does not constitute approval of the signage plan. All signs must comply with the Brentwood Sign Ordinance. A comprehensive sign package including all signs (temporary or permanent, wall or ground) must be submitted to the Planning Department for review.
7. Deviations from the approved plan in the development of a project or the failure to satisfy any standard requirements or special conditions of approval imposed by the planning commission will be considered a violation of the provisions of the Zoning Ordinance, which shall be subject to punishment as provided in Section 1-9 of the Brentwood Municipal Code. The City may also require the applicant to appear before the Planning Commission to address any deficiencies or unapproved modifications. The project may also be subject to delays in issuance of permits, certificates of occupancy, recordation of plats or other project approvals.
8. Any changes to plans approved by the Planning Commission will require staff review and re-approval by the Planning Commission.
9. Development of this project shall comply with all applicable codes and ordinances of the City of Brentwood.
10. All previous conditions placed on the project by the Planning Commission shall remain applicable to the project.
11. Approval of the proposed plan shall be limited to the illustrations and plans presented to the Planning Commission for review and approval on March 4, 2019. Any changes to Planning Commission approved plans and specifications will require staff review and re-approval by the Planning Commission.

Ms. Crigger second. Motion was approved 8-0 with Mr. Church voting no and Ms. Robinson abstaining.

**Item 3:** **BPC1902-003 Revised Site Plan – AC Marriott Hotel Brentwood, Hill Center Brentwood, Phase II, Zoning C-2**

Goodwyn, Mills & Cawood requested approval of a revised site plan for the AC Marriott Hotel at the Hill Center Brentwood. The proposed changes included:

1. The addition of seven rooms for a total of 148;
2. Slight reduction in the building footprint;
3. Sight modification to the exterior façade.

The additional seven rooms are gained due to the elimination of a previously proposed ground floor meeting room. The overall area of the building remains unchanged.

Ordinance 2014-11, approved in July 2014 permitted the option of substituting one of the office buildings with a hotel, having an overall area of 100,000 sf and would not exceed 150 rooms.

The total area of the development is not to exceed 600,000 square feet.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| ***Existing Location*** | ***Parking Provided*** |  | ***Building*** | ***Square Footage*** | ***Parking Required*** |
| *Surface Parking* | *168* |  | ***Building A*** | ***95,824*** | ***373*** |
| *Bldg B Garage* | *40* |  | Office | 66,062 | 220 |
| *Bldg D Garage* | *874* |  | Restaurant | 4,984 | 50 |
| ***TOTAL*** | ***1,082*** |  | Retail | 21,974 | 88 |
|  |  |  | Dentist Office | 2,804 | 11 + 2 dropoff |
| ***Proposed Location*** | ***Proposed Parking*** |  | ***Building B*** | ***126,971*** | ***485*** |
| *Surface Parking* | *145* |  | Office | 103,034 | 344 |
| *Bldg E Garage* | *295* |  | Restaurant | 7,632 | 76 |
| *Bldg H1 Garage* | *75* |  | Retail | 16,305 | 65 |
| *Hotel Parking* | *54* |  | ***Building C1 & C2*** | ***19,328*** | ***193*** |
| ***TOTAL*** | ***569*** |  | ***Building D1 -* Retail** | ***9,606*** | ***39*** |
|  |  |  | ***Building E1 -* Retail** | ***8,900*** | ***36*** |
|  |  |  | ***Building H1 -* Office** | ***84,375*** | ***281*** |
|  |  |  | ***Building H2 -* Hotel** | ***92,952*** | ***168 - 148 rooms + 20 employees*** |
| ***TOTAL PARKING (Proposed + Existing)*** | ***1,651*** |  | ***TOTAL REQUIRED*** | ***437,956*** | ***1,573*** |

Mr. Pippen moved for approval of the Revised Site Plan subject to the following conditions being met to the satisfaction of staff:

1. Provide a photometric plan that complies with Section 78- 226(c) of the Municipal Code.
2. Additional water/server tap fees and public works project fees will, be required for the additional rooms.
3. A revised final plat showing the minor modifications to the joint access easement, located on the east side of the proposed hotel, shall be recorded before a permit will be issued for the project.
4. Approval of the revised site plan by the Planning Commission shall vested for a period of three years for the original date of approval.
5. Add the following note to the site plan;

This site plan is subject to a three year vesting period, during which the development standards in effect on the date of approval will remain the standards applicable to this plan.  If construction is not completed during the first three years, the original site plan is considered a preliminary site plan and the applicant must obtain approval of a final site plan. Development of the property shown on this plan may be subject to standards other than those that were applicable during the vesting period.  The Initial vesting period for this plan expires on January 2, 2021, unless extended by the City of Brentwood.  Persons relying on this plan after said date should contact the City of Brentwood to determine if development may continue as depicted on the plan.

1. When the construction authorized pursuant to a site plan is not completed within three years from the date of initial approval, but the applicant desires to complete the project proposed for the site, the plan as initially approved for the project or as amended shall be considered a preliminary site plan. If the applicant secures all necessary permits, commences site preparation and obtains approval of a final site plan within the three-year vesting period following approval of the preliminary site plan, then the vesting period shall be extended an additional two years beyond the expiration of the initial three-year vesting period. During the two-year extension, the applicant must commence construction and maintain any necessary permits to remain vested.
2. If necessary permits are maintained and construction, as defined by Section 78-43, has commenced by the end of the two-year extension, then the vesting period shall remain in effect until the Planning and Codes Department has certified final completion of the project, provided the total vesting period shall not exceed ten years from the date of approval of the preliminary site plan.
3. If the construction authorized pursuant to a site plan is completed within three years from the date of approval, the site plan shall then be considered the final site plan for the project.
4. The property owner is responsible for all development fees including water and sewer service and tap fees, building permit fees and Public Works Project Fees. The required fees shall be used for future infrastructure related improvements required by the proposed development.
5. A Maintenance Agreement and Storm Water System Long-Term Operation and Maintenance Plan for all storm water structures and facilities must be prepared, submitted and approved per Section 56-43 of the Brentwood Code.
6. Approval of the site plan does not constitute approval of the signage plan. All signs must comply with the Brentwood Sign Ordinance. A comprehensive sign package including all signs (temporary or permanent, wall or ground) must be submitted to the Planning Department for review.
7. At structure number 5, match the top of pipes of the 18” and 24” pipes.
8. The maximum total square footage of all buildings within the development shall be 600,000 square feet.
9. The southern facades of the future buildings, including the garage, located adjacent to the buffer, as reflected on the Master Plan, shall be designed to prevent visibility of the interior of the buildings and interior lighting at night from the adjacent properties.
10. Deviations from the approved plan in the development of a project or the failure to satisfy any standard requirements or special conditions of approval imposed by the planning commission will be considered a violation of the provisions of the Zoning Ordinance, which shall be subject to punishment as provided in Section 1-9 of the Brentwood Municipal Code. The City may also require the applicant to appear before the Planning Commission to address any deficiencies or unapproved modifications. The project may also be subject to delays in issuance of permits, certificates of occupancy, recordation of plats or other project approvals.
11. Any changes to plans approved by the Planning Commission will require staff review and re-approval by the Planning Commission.
12. Development of this project shall comply with all applicable codes and ordinances of the City of Brentwood.
13. All previous conditions placed on the project by the Planning Commission shall remain applicable to the project.
14. Approval of the proposed plan shall be limited to the illustrations and plans presented to the Planning Commission for review and approval on March 4, 2019. Any changes to Planning Commission approved plans and specifications will require staff review and re-approval by the Planning Commission.

Mr. Clark second; motion was passed unanimously.

# OTHER BUSINESS

**Monthly Security Report**

Mr. Oliver moved for approval of the monthly security report; seconded by Mr. Church. Approval was unanimous.

# ADMINISTRATIVE INFORMATION

The Planning and Codes monthly report was distributed to the Commissioners.

The March calendar was distributed.

Being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 9:02 pm.

APPROVED: April 1, 2019 Holly Earls \_ Holly Earls, City Recorder